NCATE Board of Examiners
Team: NA

State Team:
Dr. Nannette Bagstad, Chair
Dr. Carol Enger (ECE)
Jason Waskiewicz (Science)

State Consultant:
Dr. Janet Welk, Director ESPB

NEA or AFT Representative:
No Representative

Accreditation Visit to:

INSTITUTION
TURTLE MOUNTAIN
COMMUNITY COLLEGE

Belcourt, ND
March 29-31, 2010

Type of Visit:
- First
- Continuing
- Combination
- Probation
- Focused
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Summary for Professional Education Unit</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Conceptual Framework</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Standards</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Sources of Evidence</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## SUMMARY FOR PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION UNIT
National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education

Institution: Turtle Mountain Community College

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standards</th>
<th>Team Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1  Candidate Knowledge, Skills, and Professional Dispositions</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2  Assessment System and Unit Evaluation</td>
<td>Met with Weaknesses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3  Field Experiences and Clinical Practice</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4  Diversity</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5  Faculty Qualifications, Performance, and Development</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6  Unit Governance and Resources</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

M = Standard Met  
NM = Standard Not Met  
NA = Not Applicable for Focused Visit
I. INTRODUCTION

The Teacher Education Department operates within the larger institution of Turtle Mountain Community College (TMCC) whose mission is to serve the needs of the community by providing professional and personal options for students—those students who have low reading scores, poor school attendance, poor motivation, and a view of the world that has been shaped by the many facets of poverty prevalent on Turtle Mountain Reservation.

The seven teachings are etched in the stone arches of the main entrance and metaphorically serve as the cornerstone of TMCC’s commitment to its students, its tribal heritage, and the community it serves. Wisdom, Love Respect, Bravery, Honesty, Humility, and Truth are embedded into daily routines, instructional strategies, and the college’s dedication to the broader vision of indigenous self-determination.

The Teacher Education Department offers baccalaureate degrees in elementary education and secondary science—a composite degree in physics, chemistry, biology, and earth science. It is the intent of the Teacher Education Department to start Cohort I for a major in early childhood education.

The Turtle Mountain Community College Program Review was conducted during Spring Semester, 2007. The Program Approval Advisory Committee Report/ESPB Decision of May 31, 2007 indicated the following recommendations:

Standard 2 – Not Met
Areas for Improvement:
New: The unit does not have a system in place for compiling, aggregating, and analyzing data for tracking candidate performance or for program improvement.
Rationale: The unit does not have a plan in place for compiling, aggregating, or analyzing the data it collects on candidate performance and unit programs. Data is not aggregated or analyzed using statistical means at this time. There is no timetable for systematic or regular analysis of existing data and no plan that would indicate who is responsible for collecting, compiling, aggregating, or analyzing data.

New: The unit has not implemented electronic data management technologies to maintain its assessment data.
Rationale: The unit maintains its assessment data in paper format. This does not allow the unit to complete, aggregate, or analyze program or candidate performance data.

New: Assessment data are not regularly and systematically compiled, summarized, and analyzed to improve candidate performance, program quality, and unit operations.
Rationale: All data on candidate performance is currently kept in paper format. Data is not compiled, aggregated, or analyzed. Data is not used to determine as enrollment trends, areas of candidate strengths or weaknesses, and areas of program strengths or weaknesses.
New: The unit does not take steps to eliminate sources of bias in performance assessments.
Rationale: The unit has not established inter-rater reliability in its use of common rubrics for the scoring of candidate portfolios, admission interviews, practicum and student teaching.

Multicultural Education and Native American Studies Standard
Team Decision of Met with Weakness.

II. CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

The Turtle Mountain Reservation forms the community context for the Turtle Mountain Community College (TMCC). The enrolled members number approximately 32,000 with about half that number actually living within the geographical boundaries of the Reservation. The most recent data indicate that the unemployment rate hovers around 50% or more, which means that many of the community members have to struggle with facets of poverty that are overly focused on physical survival. This struggle for physical survival has a profound impact on the culture, on the psychological dispositions of the students in our schools, the students’ academic performance in our K-12 schools, and students’ academic performance at the college level. Matters are further complicated by the varied religious beliefs and cultural values that have led to polarized views about what it means to be Native American or indigenous.

The role of the Teacher Education Department at TMCC is to spearhead systemic and transformational change through the principles of culturally responsive teaching, in large part, to address the cultural ambiguities caused by forced assimilation and to establish a sense of self by embracing and resolving these cultural ambiguities.

The mission of the teacher education department is to implement curriculum transformation through a culturally responsive teaching model that is learner-centered, content rich, and instructionally adaptive to all learning styles and multiple intelligences. Students learn about the nature of curriculum: the formal, hidden, symbolic, and media curricula, all of which influence our views directly and indirectly. They learn that caring must be embedded into the very core of teaching and learning, that cross-cultural communication is essential for clarity of thought and nuance of expression, that the climates for learning must be welcoming, inviting, and comfortable and that we must build on the culture, experiences, and dreams of the students. Students also learn that assessment must be varied, authentic, negotiated, and reflective.

The Teacher Education Department is designed to fulfill the following ideals:

- To endow degrees, which are culturally responsive to students, teachers, and paraprofessionals within the community we serve.
- To serve as an educational change center in order to assist teachers in the field.
- To provide an array of educational resources for the schools within our geographical region.
The Teacher Education Department envisions:

- Learning environments that build on what students already know, on their dreams and life goals that expand their life’s options in order to reconfigure a life of poverty—which is essentially a life without options.

- TMCC as an advocate for social change, social justice, and as a model of transformed education in all the disciplinary fields, where students are able to broaden their views to encompass an ecological worldview integral to the living universe.

III. STANDARDS

Standard 2: Assessment System and Unit Evaluation

The unit has an assessment system that collects and analyzes data on applicant qualifications, candidate and graduate performance, and unit operations to evaluate and improve the performance of candidates, the unit, and its programs.

Information reported in the Institutional Report for Standard 2 was validated in the exhibits and interviews.

Yes ☒ No □

2a. Assessment System

Summary of Findings for Initial Teacher Preparation

Met with Weakness

Areas for Improvement:

Continued: The unit does not aggregate sufficient data &/or analyze data for program improvement.

Continued from 2007 Accreditation Visit: The unit does not take steps to eliminate sources of bias in performance assessments.

Rationale: A database system is in place, but there was no evidence that data is analyzed and used to make program changes and to facilitate unit operations.

2b. Data Collection, Analysis, and Evaluation

Summary of Findings for Initial Teacher Preparation

Met with Weakness

Areas for Improvement:

Continued: Assessment data are not systematically summarized and analyzed to improve program quality and unit operations.
Rationale: Limited evidence was provided by Minutes through May 2009 as to when and how the unit develops and reviews assessments or how faculty and regional school partners are trained to use assessments.

2c. Use of Data for Program Improvement

Summary of Findings for Initial Teacher Preparation

Met with Weakness

Areas for Improvement:
Continued: Assessment data are not systematically aggregated, summarized and analyzed for program improvement.
Rationale: Evidence was provided regarding Praxis I and II performance and the creation of remedial classes. There was no indication as to discussions and decisions made regarding program improvement.

Overall Assessment of Standard: Met with Weakness

Multicultural Education and Native American Studies Standard
Met

IV. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE

Documents reviewed:
Institutional Report
Syllabi
Rubrics
Teacher Education Manual
Minutes through May 2009
Assessment Data – Praxis
Survey Data – Alumni; Administrators
Assessment Manual
Curriculum Guides
Faculty Forms regarding Course Learning Outcomes for each class
Academic Catalog
Faculty Evaluations from Students
Evaluations of Student in the Abridged Portfolio
Sample Assessments
Practice Test for Praxis I – Remedial Class
Curriculum Exhibits
B.S. in Early Childhood Education – Junior & Senior Year – Committee Draft Copy 2/2009
General Education Requirements – Program of Study for Advisement
Persons interviewed:
Dr. Jim Davis
Larry Henry
Dr. Carmelita Lamb
Les LaFountain
Kathy Henry
Janelle Wiedrich
Kristi Dionne
Chad Davis
Michael Blue
Paul Frydenlund
Rose Marie Davis
Jennifer Ramey
Danielle Poitra
Jordan Vallie
Harold Counts
Dr. Scott Hanson
Roberto Brenes
Audrey LaVallie
Luther Olson
Jennifer Wilson
Jason Davis
Nicole J. Azure
Adrienne Laducer
13047.1 COMPOSITE SCIENCE MAJOR/GENERAL SCIENCE

The composite/general science program must include environmental science incorporated within other courses or as a separate course. The composite/general science program requires:

1. coursework in biology, chemistry, physics, and earth science, including:
   a. minimum of 24 semester hours in one area,
   b. minimum of 12 semester hours in two other areas,
   c. minimum of 4 semester hours in the fourth area,
   courses must be from those that the institution allows toward graduation in the science major;
2. study of mathematics through the pre-calculus level (college algebra and above) and statistics.

The program uses varied and authentic assessments of candidate’s understanding and ability to apply that knowledge. Examples of performance assessments in which this content knowledge could be demonstrated appear in standards 13047.2 through 13047.10 which apply to all science education programs.

A. TEAM DECISION:

   _____MET   X_____MET WITH WEAKNESS   _____NOT MET

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE:

   TMCC has now instituted a requirement for a 3 semester Statistics I course: MATH 212 in addition to the algebra and pre-calculus courses. Exhibits included curriculum guides, statistics syllabus (MATH 212), and interviews with staff and candidates who were student teaching.

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES:
   Requirement does not include MATH 213 (Statistics II)

E. RATIONALE:

   According to the Statistics 212 syllabus, the course is not intended to stand alone but rather should be coupled with Math 213 to satisfy the introductory statistics requirement of most four year universities. The Statistics 212 course does not contain the full content of a standard Statistics course.

Commented [MSOffice7]: Earlier Discussions with Dr. Welk in April 2007 led the TMCC secondary science program director to believe that the course description was open to the discretion of the college in regards to statistics, but that NDSPB required a stand-alone statistics course in order to fulfill the requirements for a composite science license. Consequently, students from the secondary science Cohort I were licensed with the one credit Environmental Statistics course that was taught by Dr. Jamie Robbins. This course was dropped from the curriculum in favor of the three credit Math 213 course that was already available to the student population at large at TMCC. Please see attached email correspondence from 9-12-2007.
50037 EARLY CHILDHOOD TEACHER EDUCATION STANDARDS

Institutions will be expected to demonstrate the use of performance assessments within their programs. Examples of such assessments will be provided by the Education Standards and Practices Board as guidelines. Institutions are not restricted to using the given examples, but may develop others that demonstrate candidates’ ability to apply what they have learned in the K-12 school setting.

50037.1 The program requires the study of typical and atypical child development to include the physical, social, emotional, language, cognitive, and aesthetic development of all young children from birth through age eight including characteristics of children as learners and as individuals. The program uses varied performance assessments of candidates’ understanding and abilities to apply that knowledge.

A. TEAM DECISION:


X MET  MET WITH WEAKNESS  NOT MET

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE:
Syllabi-EC 311 Observation, Doc, Assess,318 Language literacy, 329 Curriculum. 412 Kindergarten Meth Mat. Syllabi include ND Early Childhood Standards, NAECYD standards, and INTASC standards.

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR: Add Preschool special needs course

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES:

E. RATIONALE:

50037.2 The program requires the study of historical, philosophical, and social foundations and how these foundations influence current thought and practice in early childhood education. The program uses varied performance assessments of candidate’s understanding and abilities to apply that knowledge.

A. TEAM DECISION:


X MET  MET WITH WEAKNESS  NOT MET

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: Syllabi-ECE 310 Intro ECE, 413 Admin Leadership

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:
FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES:
E. RATIONALE:

50037.3 The program requires the study of how to establish and maintain collaborative partnerships with families, communities, and other professionals. The program uses varied performance assessments of candidates’ understanding and abilities to apply that knowledge.

A. TEAM DECISION:
   _____ MET ______ MET WITH WEAKNESS ______ NOT MET

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: Syllabi ECE 338 Home School Community, 413 Admin Leadership

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES:

E. RATIONALE:

50037.4 The program requires 16 semester hours of study in developmentally appropriate practices, and the development and implementation of curriculum instruction based on knowledge of individual children and the community. The program uses varied performance assessments of candidates’ understanding and abilities to apply that knowledge.

A. TEAM DECISION:
   ______ MET _____ MET WITH WEAKNESS ______ NOT MET


C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES: There is concern that courses may not include Art, Music, and Movement for BOTH preschool classrooms and primary classrooms.

E. RATIONALE: While faculty intend to revise courses, this is still in the planning stage. Consider supplementing ECE 329 Curriculum with additional course work in Art,
Music and Movement-students need to be able to incorporate these creative activities in both preschool classrooms and primary classrooms.

50037.5 The program requires the study of strategies to encourage positive social interaction among children, to promote positive conflict resolution, and to develop personal self-control, self-motivation, and self-esteem. The program uses varied performance assessments of candidates’ understanding and abilities to apply that knowledge.

A. TEAM DECISION:

   ☑ MET   ☐ MET WITH WEAKNESS   ☐ NOT MET

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: Syllabi ECE 336 Soc Emo, 318 Lang Literacy

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES:

E. RATIONALE:

50037.6 The program requires the study of formal and informal assessment, the use of assessment information on planning and individualizing curriculum and teaching practices, and on providing feedback to families of all young children. The program uses varied performance assessments of candidates’ understanding and abilities to apply that knowledge.

A. TEAM DECISION:

   ☑ MET   ☐ MET WITH WEAKNESS   ☐ NOT MET

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: Syllabi ECE 311 Obs Doc Assess, 412 Kindergarten Meth Mat, 320 Infant toddler. Check is EDUC 410 in curriculum exhibit?

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES:
E. RATIONALE:

50037.7 The program requires the study of current, appropriate instructional and augmentative technologies for professions, children, and families. The program uses varied performance assessments of candidates’ understanding and abilities to apply that knowledge.

A. TEAM DECISION:

_____MET X MET WITH WEAKNESS _____NOT MET

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: syllabi ECE 318 Lang Literacy, 415 student teaching.

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES:

E. RATIONALE:

50037.8 The program requires the study of actively modeling professionalism, advocacy, ethical behavior, and commitment to lifelong learning. The program uses varied performance assessments of candidates’ understanding and abilities to apply that knowledge.

A. TEAM DECISION:

XX MET _____MET WITH WEAKNESS _____NOT MET

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: Syllabi ECE 413 Admin Leadership, 338 Home School

Community, 310 Intro ECE.

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES:

E. RATIONALE:

Commented [MSOffice9]: Changes have been made to all syllabi that will include students from Elementary, Secondary and Early Childhood within the same section. An example is included for your review.
The program requires three supervised field experiences and two student teaching experiences. One student teaching experience must be in an accredited pre-kindergarten or kindergarten setting and the other in grades 1, 2, or 3, and include the opportunity to work with children with special needs. The program uses varied performance assessments of candidates’ understanding and abilities to apply that knowledge.

A. TEAM DECISION:

___ MET      X MET WITH WEAKNESS      NOT MET

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE. The three field experiences are Practicum I and II (40 hours each), and EC 311 (15 hours). Students complete many additional assignments in other courses, such as EC 318, that also require direct experiences teaching young children.

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR: Clarification that the student teaching must be in a pre-K or K and then in either grade 1, 2, or 3.

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES: The program has not yet started, so no students have completed student teaching. Will the field experiences be with diverse age groups (infant/toddler, preschool/kindergarten, primary)?

E. RATIONALE: Plans are being discussed for including field experiences with infants and toddlers, but are not yet in place. We did not find documentation with evidence that the field experiences will be with diverse age groups.

The program requires the study of basic principles of administration, organization, leadership and operation of early childhood programs, including supervision of staff, volunteers, and program evaluation. The program uses varied performance assessments of candidates’ understanding and abilities to apply that knowledge.

A. TEAM DECISION:

__X__ MET      ______ MET WITH WEAKNESS      ______ NOT MET

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: Syllabi ECE 411 Pre-K Meth Mat, 413 Admin Leadership, 415 Stu Teaching

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:
FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES:

E. RATIONALE:

Candidate assessment data are regularly and systematically collected, compiled, aggregated, summarized, and analyzed to improve candidate performance, program quality, and program operations. The program disaggregates candidate assessment data when candidates are in alternate route, off-campus, and distance learning programs.

A. TEAM DECISION: Defer to ESPB team decision regarding assessment data system.

NCATE STANDARDS-EARLY CHILDHOOD TEACHER EDUCATION

Standard I. Candidate Knowledge, Skills and Dispositions.

A. TEAM DECISION:

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: Narrative pg 26, 27 IR, Student Program of Study. Curriculum Exhibit Form has been updated.

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR: ECE 337, Preschool Special Needs course was added to the Program of Study and to the Curriculum Exhibit Form.

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES: Some of the ECE syllabi have elementary standards but few, if any, ND early childhood standards. Some of the syllabi and other documents have errors in course numbers and names.

E. RATIONALE: Plans are to begin the first cohort Fall, 2010. Early Childhood Faculty are planning to collaborate with elementary education faculty to team teach some courses, such as Educational Technology, and to add early childhood content into course syllabi but there is no documentation with evidence of this yet.

Standard 2. Assessment System and Unit Evaluations.

A. TEAM DECISION: Defer to ESPB standard review decision regarding assessment system.

While some assessments will be the same as the elementary program, there will need to be some assessments specific to ECE. There has been discussion of adding the Praxis II Early Childhood test, different dispositions specific to early childhood, and
early childhood course assessments. Syllabi include ND Early Childhood Standards, NAEYC standards, and INTASC standards.

Standard 3. Field Experiences and Clinical Practice.
A. TEAM DECISION:
   _____MET   X__MET WITH WEAKNESS   _____NOT MET
B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: pg 53 IR. Plans are being discussed to require three field experiences with diverse age groups (infant/toddler, preschool/kindergarten, primary).
C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:
D. WEAKNESSES: The program has not yet started, so no students have completed a student teaching. Will the field experiences be with diverse age groups (infant/toddler, preschool/kindergarten, primary)?
E. RATIONALE: Plans are being discussed for including field experiences with infants and toddlers, but are not yet in place. We did not find documentation with evidence that the field experiences will be with diverse age groups.

A. TEAM DECISION:
   X__MET   _____MET WITH WEAKNESS   _____NOT MET
B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: Narrative pg 55 of IR
C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:
D. WEAKNESSES:
E. RATIONALE:

Commented [MSOffice15]: Syllabi for Practicum I and II included for your review.
B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: Student interviews were highly complementary towards faculty. Faculty have masters degrees and plan to continue for doctorates. The Institution strongly supports their professional development.

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES:

E. RATIONALE:


A. TEAM DECISION:

_____MET   X MET WITH WEAKNESS   _____NOT MET

B. SOURCES OF EVIDENCE: Narrative Pg 59 of IR. Early Childhood program has a Title III grant. Faculty plan to be self sustaining in the future. An External Advisory Committee has been established to assess specific areas of the program, to help carry out activities (such as assessing portfolios), and to promote the program.

C. CORRECTIONS TO THE IR:

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

D. WEAKNESSES: The only documentation of the External Advisory Committee meeting are minutes from February, 2009.

E. RATIONALE: The External Advisory Committee needs to meet regularly so that members can provide support for the program.

Overall program-Early Childhood Education

A. TEAM DECISION:

_____MET   X MET WITH WEAKNESS   _____NOT MET

FOR DECISIONS OF “MET WITH WEAKNESS” OR “NOT MET”:

RATIONALE: The program is still in the planning stage. A number of decisions will need to be made and documented before students can graduate with this new degree.